



Travel Reduction and Outreach Division

Phone: 602.506.6010

Email: AQMail@Maricopa.gov

Maricopa.gov/AQ

CleanAirMakeMore.com



MARICOPA COUNTY TRAVEL REDUCTION PROGRAM REGIONAL TASK FORCE Teleconference Meeting (all participants joined via GoToMeeting)

Jerry Geering, Chairman
October 13 & October 14, 2020

MEMBERS PRESENT

Annie Foster
Jean Woltjer
Kim Passante
*Present 10/14 only

Chelsie Hockersmith*
Jerry Geering
Tina Wesoloskie

ABSENT

Terry Solis
Sheila Johnson

STAFF / VISITORS PRESENT

Kristen Weston-Smith, Morgan Wohlbrandt, Joel Fowler – Maricopa County TRP
Lisa Richey – Maricopa County TRP (10/13 only)
Peter Muthig – Deputy County Attorney
Lillian Duarte – Valley Metro (10/13 only)
Abigail Cooksey-Williams – Valley Metro (10/14 only)
Amanda Luecker – Arizona Department of Environmental Quality
Dean Giles – Maricopa Association of Governments
Rebecca Schexnayder – Pinal County (10/13 only)
Michael Saltzstein – El Super Phoenix (10/13 only)
Ed Jones – City of Mesa (10/13 only)
Kimberly Landry, Kendra Beseler – Liberty Mutual (10/13 only)
Gloria Mathis, Julia Terrell – Arizona Grand Resort & Spa (10/13 only)

Call to Order

Jerry Geering called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m. (quorum present).

Meeting Minutes

Kim Passante motioned to approve the September 15, 2020 minutes and Annie Foster seconded.
Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Variance Requests

American Airlines – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer is supposed to survey November 1st and TRP staff would be comfortable granting a variance from implementing plan incentives until a new plan is submitted after the survey period since a large portion of the previous plan's budget was spent on a bus/rail subsidy. Annie Foster motioned to grant the organization a variance from implementing plan measures through December 31, 2020. Jean Woltjer seconded. Kim Passante voted aye and the motion passed.

Arizona Grand Resort & Spa – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer is requesting a variance allowing a decrease in their TRP budget to \$2,500 due to many employees being furloughed. After discussion between the Task Force members and Gloria Mathis, a survey start date of October 26th was agreed on. Kim Passante motioned to grant the employer a variance allowing them to survey on October 26th before returning to their normal survey schedule in May and decrease their current

annual plan budget to \$2,500. Annie Foster seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Corral Phoenix, LLC – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer was originally to be submitted for enforcement but now reports both locations are closed permanently. She also verified she has seen the business and they are closed. Kim Passante motioned to accept the documentation submitted by the employer and remove them from TRP unless they reopen. Annie Foster seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

DoubleTree Suites by Hilton Hotel Phoenix – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer has laid off a number of employees but doesn't yet have 6 months worth of documentation showing under 50 employees. Kim Passante made a motion to grant the employer a variance from awarding TRP incentives and taking the TRP survey until January 31, 2021. Annie Foster seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Farmers Insurance – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer is requesting a variance due to a large number of employees currently telecommuting. She also stated the organization typically surveys in April and while TRP staff would be comfortable with a reduction in their approved plan budget due to the telecommuting measures, staff doesn't support a complete variance from awarding all measures entirely. Kim Passante motioned to deny the employer's variance request. Annie Foster seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Fleing's Prime Steakhouse & Wine Bar – DC Ranch – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer had previously been granted a plan variance and was now requesting a variance from all TRP measures due to a lack of public transit and current safety guidelines. She added TRP does recommend the employer be granted a variance due to the fluctuating number of seasonal employees. Kim Passante motioned to grant the employer a variance from awarding TRP incentives and taking the TRP survey until December 31, 2021. Annie Foster seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Fresenius Medical Care North America – Kristen Weston-Smith said this is a year 1 company and TRP staff was recommending a year 1 exemption per statute. She shared the organization has already surveyed for this program year but not submitted a plan; an exemption would allow them to not submit a travel reduction plan for the current year and they would survey on December 1st. Kim Passante motioned to grant the employer an exemption for the first program year and to resume the annual TRP survey on December 1st. Annie Passante seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Fry's Electronics – Phoenix – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer typically has around 50 employees but is currently at 19 active employees and all other employees are furloughed. She shared since the employees are furloughed and not laid off, the employer cannot provide documentation showing an under 50 employee count. Kim Passante made a motion to grant the employer a variance from awarding TRP incentives and taking the TRP survey until January 31, 2021. Annie Foster seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Hotel Palomar Phoenix – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer has furloughed many employees but does not have documentation showing they have been under 50 employees for 6 months yet. Kim Passante made a motion to grant the employer a variance from awarding TRP incentives and submitting a travel reduction plan until January 31, 2021. Annie Foster seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Liberty Mutual – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer is requesting a variance from the TRP survey due to a large number of telecommuters and currently TRP staff does not support the request. She stated the employer would also need to submit telecommuting documentation if the variance request is approved. Kendra Beseler said Liberty Mutual is focusing on staff and trying to

avoid any additional hardships including taking the TRP survey. She requested a variance be granted postponing the TRP survey until employees have returned to the office for at least 2 months. Jerry Geering said many companies are currently using telecommuting and survey results from this time reflect a drop in SOV rates and helps calculate how much pollution is being saved. Kendra shared that many other cities like Boston and Seattle have cancelled any travel reduction surveys and asked if she could provide data from telecommuting employees rather than having them take the survey but Jerry Geering stated this would not provide the same data the survey collects. Kim Passante motioned to deny the employer's variance request and set their TRP survey for 2020 to start on November 12. Jean Woltjer seconded. Annie Foster voted aye and the motion passed.

Mesa, City of – Kristen Weston-Smith said the TC is requesting a variance to allow for additional time to prepare for the intranet survey and that TRP staff had no recommendation. Jerry Geering said the organization's survey would normally be held in May and questioned why the employer is not able to administer it now. Ed Jones explained the survey is normally done through the intranet method which would require the employer to devote additional resources and personnel to collect employee counts and work with the survey infrastructure to allow the survey to work. Jerry argued the employer submitted the variance request 5 or 6 weeks previously and should have been using that time to prepare for the survey since the variance request hadn't yet been granted. Discussion was held regarding the employer's use of intranet surveys versus internet surveys and Jerry referred the organization to follow up with TRP staff for assistance in administering the surveys and tracking participation. After discussion of the start date and the potential effect delays could have, October 20th was agreed upon by Task Force members as the survey start date. Jean Woltjer motioned to deny the organization's variance request and set the survey start date to October 20th. Kim Passante seconded. Annie Foster voted aye and the motion passed.

Sheraton Grand Phoenix – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer has laid off a number of employees but doesn't yet have 6 months worth of documentation showing under 50 employees. Annie Foster made a motion to grant the employer a variance from awarding TRP incentives and taking the TRP survey until January 31, 2021. Kim Passante seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Enforcement Action Requests

El Super Phoenix – Kristen Weston-Smith said a Request for Documentation was sent in February and a Notice of Violation was issued after the variance ended in October. Michael Saltzstein stated further deadlines won't be missed and he would work to submit necessary documentation. He also confirmed TRP does have current TC and HRLO info but he hadn't had a chance to connect with them regarding documentation and asked for more time to come into compliance. Annie Foster motioned to give employer a final 14 days to submit documentation and Jean Woltjer seconded. Kim Passante voted aye and the motion passed.

Plans Offered with 'Disapprove' Recommendation

Boeing Distribution Systems Inc. – Mesa – Kristen Weston-Smith said TRP is requesting the organization submit telecommuter documentation to support the budget reduction of the plan. Kim Passante motioned to accept staff's disapproved recommendation and give the employer 7 days to submit a revised plan. Jean Woltjer seconded. Annie Foster voted aye and the motion passed.

Consent Agenda

Kim Passante motioned to approve all plans on the consent agenda and Annie Foster seconded. Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Discussion / Action

Request to rescind the 180 Day TRP Staff Plan Review Variance – Kristen Weston-Smith stated after reviewing statute, the variance granted at the previous meeting allowing TRP staff additional time to review submitted plans was no longer needed. Jean Woltjer made a motion to rescind the 180 Day TRP Staff Variance motion passed at the September 15th Task Force meeting. Kim Passante seconded. Annie Foster voted aye and the motion passed.

Recess

Annie Foster made a motion to recess until October 14th at 9:30 am. Jean Woltjer seconded. Kim Passante voted aye and the motion passed.

Call to Order

Jerry Geering readjoined the meeting on October 14th at 9:33 a.m. (quorum present).

Enforcement Action Requests

Abrazo – Arizona Heart Institute – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer submitted documentation and no enforcement action was necessary. Kim Passante motioned to reject staff's original enforcement action request and Annie Foster seconded. Chelsie Hockersmith and Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

FedEx Freight – North – Kristen Weston-Smith said a Request for Documentation and Notice of Violation had been issued with no response from the TC. Annie Foster motioned to give employer a final 7 days to submit delinquent documentation and Jean Woltjer seconded. Chelsie Hockersmith and Kim Passante voted aye and the motion passed.

iQor – Kristen Weston-Smith said the employer submitted documentation and no enforcement action was necessary. Kim Passante motioned to reject staff's original enforcement action request and Chelsie Hockersmith seconded. Annie Foster and Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Larry H. Miller – Nissan Mesa – Kristen Weston-Smith said an audit was conducted and the TC said they had no TRP documentation available so a Request for Documentation was issued. She said the auditor has continued to reach out and while the TC did submit some documentation it was not what was requested so a Notice of Violation was issued. Kim Passante motioned to give employer a final 7 days to submit delinquent documentation and Jean Woltjer seconded. Annie Foster and Chelsie Hockersmith voted aye and the motion passed.

Origami Owl – Kristen Weston-Smith said a Request for Documentation and Notice of Violation had been issued with no response from the TC. Annie Foster motioned to give employer a final 7 days to submit delinquent documentation and Chelsie Hockersmith seconded. Kim Passante and Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

RED Development – Kristen Weston-Smith said a Request for Documentation and Notice of Violation had been issued with no response from the TC. Kim Passante motioned to give employer a final 7 days to submit delinquent documentation and Chelsie Hockersmith seconded. Annie Foster and Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Ticketmaster – Kristen Weston-Smith said a Request for Documentation and Notice of Violation had been issued with no response from the TC. Jean Woltjer motioned to give employer a final 7 days to submit delinquent documentation and Annie Foster seconded. Chelsie Hockersmith and Kim Passante voted aye and the motion passed.

Open Items

Western Window Systems – Kristen Weston-Smith said the TC is working with TRP to provide all documentation requested and no further action is necessary at this time.

Zillow Group, Inc. – Kristen Weston-Smith said a revised plan had been received and was approved at #29 on the consent agenda.

Discussion / Action

Avondale Elementary School District Request for Documentation Update – Kristen Weston-Smith said Avondale Elementary School District had an open Request for Documentation when the TRP variance went into effect in March and the school had closed prior to that due to COVID-19 and therefore documentation was not received. She asked the Task Force for guidance on whether the audit and RFD could be closed or if enforcement action needed to be pursued. Chelsie Hockersmith motioned to close the outstanding audit and RFD and have Avondale Elementary School District move forward as usual with their current program year. Kim Passante seconded. Annie Foster and Jean Woltjer voted aye and the motion passed.

Travel Reduction Plan Format P-7 Revisions – Kristen Weston-Smith shared due to the updated P-7 ordinance the current travel reduction plan format will need to be revised to update the measures listed. She also stated the new plan will go into effect in November and requested the Task Force members review the proposed plan for any changes and then the plan will be presented at the next meeting.

Valley Metro

Abigail Cooksey-Williams reviewed the update.

Call to Public

None.

Updates from Chairman and Other Members

None.

Adjournment

Terry Solis motioned to adjourn the meeting and Sheila Johnson seconded. Annie Foster and Chelsie Hockersmith voted aye and the motion passed (10:05 a.m.). The next meeting will be Tuesday, November 17, 2020.